





## CAMP/BENCH REPORT

# NANDURBAR, MADHYA PRADESH 26th July, 2019

NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR PROTECTION OF CHILD RIGHTS NEW DELHI

Working Report

#### INTRODUCTION

The National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR) conducted its National Bench/Camp in Nandurbar District which is situated in Maharashtra. The programme was organised on 26<sup>th</sup> July, 2019 and was chaired by Dr. R. G. Anand, Honourable Member of National Commission for the Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR). The bench also consisted of Shri Pravin Shivajirao Ghuge, Chairperson from Maharashtra State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (MSCPCR); and shri. Santosh Shinde, Member (MSCPCR); Shri Rajendra Bharud, District Collector of Nandurbar; and Shri Sanjay S Gaikwad, Addl. District Magistrate, Dhule. The Bench/ Camp at Nandurbar received an inadequate and restricted response from the participating District administration of Dhule and 189 Non Governmental Organisations (NGO) involved from both the districts across the various sectors of health, education, juvenile justice, child labour etc. despite prevailing child-centric issues in all the core indicators of development as stated by NITI AAYOG.

The key highlights of the Bench/Camp were:-

- The Bench/Camp received 99 complaints from both the districts and passed orders on 76 complaints on the same day.
- Dr. R. G Anand, Member NCPCR facilitated Education Department Officials, Dhule and Dr. Harshal
  for their project digital learning in school executed in 1102 government schools in Dhule district and
  pilot to be conducted in 2200 Anganwadi.
- The Bench/ Camp witnessed progressive action against child labour. On- spot enquiry was conducted with the Child Labour officers about inspections conducted over the past 5 years. Immediate intervention was made by Shri Rajendra Bharud, District Collector of Nandurbar with the Department officials over the lack of action and inadequacy of staff.
- The Maharashtra State Commission for Protection of Child Rights also extended its support and valuable inputs during the meeting conducted with department officials of both the districts dated 25/07/2019 as well as on the day of the sitting of Bench/ Camp.
- The representation of Childline and NGOs from both districts during the proceeding was highly unsatisfactory and deficient of any significant efforts. The complaints received from NGO's were negligible.
- Furthermore, since the district of Nandurbar is predominant in tribal population, the response from public was also limited to reporting from urban region of the district and negligent from the rural areas despite significant insufficiencies in infrastructure, health, education etc. However, the field work required from the end of district administration and NGOs in rural areas could have otherwise extended

as the building block in getting attention to the issues of tribal population and getting their complaints registered on the day of the bench. The lack of collaborated effort resulted in under reporting of complaints from the major section of the Nandurbar population.

• Response of complainants from Dhule district was negligent. No complaints were received from Childline, Dhule.

#### BEFORE THE SITTING OF THE BENCH/CAMP

#### 1. Ngo Consultation Meet

The National Commission for the Protection of Child Rights conducted an NGO Consultation meet on 24.07.2019. Shri Rajendra Barud, District Collector of Nandurbar chaired the consultation meeting along with Sh. Anil N Pawar, Resident Deputy Collector (RDC), Nandurbar and NCPCR team constituted for the present bench/ Camp. In the session, Sh. Anil. Pawar, RDC, Nandurbar informed the NGO's about the objective and purpose of constituting a national bench/camp related to child rights violations in the district and asked them to bring complaint grid or complainants highlighting the child rights violation from the district on the day of the sitting of National Bench. There were 12 NGOs who participated in this meeting.

The Key highlights from the Consultation Meetings were:-

- From the list of 249 Ngos registered in NITI Darpan portal only 12 NGO's attended the consultation meeting at District Collector's office- all 11 NGO's came from Nandurbar district, while only Child line attended from Dhule district.
- The 11 district from Nandurbar district were representative from the area of children education and literacy, health & family welfare, shelter homes, rural development & poverty alleviation.
- Based on the emails communicated to all 249 NGO's and follow-up initiated over a span of one week before the bench, there were no complaints presented childline or NGOs representatives from both the districts.
- Since, the meeting to brief the NGOs was conveyed two days before the bench dated 24/07/ 2019, the NGOs effectively had one more day to initiate field work and generate complaints from public or based on the evaluations of their previous work done in their respective districts.
- They were encouraged to spread awareness about the sitting of NCPCR bench/ camp and report more complaints from the predominant rural regions comprising of Adivasi to ensure maximum representation from all the different sections of the population.

• Only few NGO's participated on the day of the sitting of the bench/camp and predominantly from Nandurbar District.

S.No.	Name of the District	Total No. of NGO's	No. of NGO's at Consultation Meeting	Registration of the NGO's from 10 districts (%)
1	Nandurbar	86	11	12.79%
2	Dhule	163	1	0.61%
	Total	249	12	4.81%

#### **INSPECTION VISIT**

Field visits to various child care institutions, Anganwadi centres and schools were conducted on 25/07/2019. NCPCR team was accompanied by two officers from District Child Protection Unit (DCPU). he The objective of conducting the inspection was to review the performance and standards of the facilities provided to the children in Anganwadi centres, schools etc. and simultaneously take suo moto cognizance on the matters pertaining to child rights violations in these institutes. Based on the observations of irregularities or violations existing in their current infrastructure or discharge of their responsibilities w.r.t. the governing laws under relevant acts, suo moto cognizance was taken of 5 CCIs, 4 Anganwadi centres and 3 Zila parishad primary schools.

#### ANGANWADI VISIT

Anganwadi No.1, Hol Tarfe Haveli (Ranale Project), Nandurbar

Based on the visit of the NCPCR Officials dated 25/07/2019 to Anganwadi No. 1, Hol Tarfe Haveli (Ranale Project), the observations have been made. The infrastructure of the Anganwadi was observed to be sufficient. It had a clean and hygienic environment around it. The anganwadi worker was attending to the children and mothers by giving them lessons. The anganwadi was equipped with a kitchen as well. Sufficient IEC material was found in the premises including the scale for measuring children's height, weight etc. the Anganwadi worker had received training in ICDS-CAS and had all the data pertaining to children, number of families, record of severely Malnourished (SAM) and Moderately Malnourished (MAM) children updated and stored in

her mobile phone. However, there was very poor sanitation maintained in toilets. It was almost inaccessible for children. Furthermore, 12 children reportedly fell under MAM category.

Anganwadi No. 2, Hol Tarfe Haveli Nandurbar

Based on the visit of the NCPCR Officials dated 25/07/2019 to Anganwadi No. 2, Hol Tarfe Haveli, the observations have been made. The infrastructure of the Anganwadi was observed to be sufficient and functional. The anganwadi worker managing the centre had received training in ICDS-CAS and had all the data pertaining to children, no. of families, record of severely Malnourished (SAM) and Moderately Malnourished (MAM) children etc. updated and stored in her mobile phone. Sanitation and availability of clean drinking water were the major issues identified during the visit. There were 13 children recorded under MAM. Despite of proper nutrition made available at the Anganwadi, due to high level of poverty and lack of minimum facilities and amenities available at home, children still remained deprived of balanced diet.

Anganwadi No. 2, Dahindule, Nandurbar

Based on the visit of the NCPCR officials dated 25/07/2019 to Anganwadi No. 2, Dahindule, Nandurbar the Anganwadi worker managing the centre was found to have received training in ICDS- CAS and had the records updated pertaining to no. of children, families, height of children, nutrition and diet scale etc. However, infrastructure of the Anganwadi was observed to be insufficient. During the visit, the following issues were identified: lack of functional toilet in the premises, availability of IEC material etc. Recently a new building was constructed for the Anganwadi, yet the toilet was not functional in it. The Anganwadi hadn't shifted to the new building situated adjacent to the old building yet, both the toilets in either of the building were inaccessible. Moreover, children were found to be defecating in open. A functional kitchen was not available in the premises among other significant lapses.

Anganwadi No. 1, Dahindule Buclnik (1), Nandurbar

Based on the visit of the NCPCR officials dated 25/07/2019 to Anganwadi No. 1, Dahindule, Nandurbar the Anganwadi worker managing the centre was found to have received training in ICDS- CAS and had the records updated digitally. However, certain issues were identified in the AWC- there was a lack of availability of drinking water and there was lack of a functional toilet for children in the premises.

#### CHILD CARE INSTITUTION (CCI) VISIT

C. R Children Home, Nandurbar

Based on the visit of the NCPCR officials dated 25/07/2019 to C. R. Children Home, following irregularities and violations w.r.t JJ Act were observed.

- Despite the sitting of JJB and CWC in the same premises, there were significant infrastructural lapsesno beds/cots available for children, children slept on floor, the toilets and bathroom had a rock for children to clean clothes personally.
- 'There was an evident lack of staff including superintendent, probation officer, counselors etc. total staff was only 8, including cook, clerk, 4 caretaker, teacher and part time medical doctor.
- No maintenance of registers, diet chart and other significant records;
- Individual care plan weren't prepared and duly recorded in case files of children among other significant lapses.

Kankeshwar Balkashram, Sojas Balikashram and Kalyani Bal Sadan, Taloda tehsil, Nandurbar district

Based on the visit of the NCPCR officials dated 25/07/2019 to Kankeshwar Balkashram (capacity 50 and 100), Sojas Balikashram and Kalyani Bal Sadan, Taloda tehsil, Nandurbar district, suo-moto cognizance was taken based on the observation of grave irregularities and violations w.r.t. JJ Act 2015. The infrastructure was highly inappropriate and shared among the 4 shelter homes. One of the rooms was utilized as a storage space for onions. Both girls and boys were segregated and kept in separate rooms instead of separate CCIs. There was no clear demarcation of separate facilities such as medical room, playground, classroom, hall etc across the 4 CCIs. The standards of care provided to children were highly inadequate and unsatisfactory. Lack of toilets, rooms, beds, basic amenities management of case files, lack of presenting the children to CWC regularly were among other grave insufficiencies and irregularities observed during the visit.

#### SCHOOL VISIT

Zila Parishad School Patonda, Nandurbar district

The total strength of the school was 137, comprising of 77 girls and 60 boys. Based on the visit to the Zila Parishad School Patonda, Nandurbar district dated 25/07/2019 suo-moto cognizance was taken of the severe infrastructural deficits observed in the school premises. The Classrooms of class III and IV were located 500m

away from the main school building. There was a severe lack of drinking water facility available for the children. Of the 5 available washrooms, 3 were non-operational and in a pathetic condition. Children were reported to be defecating in open. They were also barefoot and in no proper uniform. Apart from the significant lapses in school infrastructure, children were found cleaning classrooms with a sweeper and interrupted upon the enquiry of NCPCR team.

Zila Parishad School Dahindule, Nandurbar District

The total strength of the school was 112, comprising of 55 girls and 57 boys. Based on the visit to the Zila Parishad School Dahindule, Nandurbar district dated 25/07/2019 suo-moto cognizance was taken of the severe infrastructural deficits observed in the school premises. There were only 2 toilets available in the schools premises for both boys and girls. The toilets were kept open and used by all children. Not all toilets had doors to ensure the safety and privacy of children. There was a sweeper in the school who was also responsible for cooking mid-day meal. Overall the entire infrastructure of the school seemed in a poor condition with not adequate means and amenities for children.

Zila Parishad School Hol Tarff Haweli, Nandurbar District

Based on the visit to the Zila Parishad School Hol Tarff Haweli, Nandurbar district dated 25/07.109, suo-moto cognizance was taken of the severe infrastructural deficits observed in the school premises- open-defecation was reported due to lack of proper toilet facilities in schools. There was leakage in the roof of classrooms. Inappropriate curriculum was observed to be taught across grade I-IV. Children were found to be taught lessons on English alphabets and basic number counting in mathematics. Among the multiple infrastructural deficts, there was a highly improper water and sanitation facility mechanism available in the premises.

## ON THE DAY OF THE SITTING OF THE BENCH/CAMP

The National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR) conducted its National Bench/Camp in Nandurbar District which is situated in Maharashtra. The programme was organised on 26<sup>th</sup> July, 2019 and was chaired by Dr. R. G. Anand, Honourable Member of National Commission for the Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR). The bench also consisted of Shri Pravin Shivajirao Ghuge, Chairperson from Maharashtra State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (MSCPCR); and shri. Santosh Shinde, Member (MSCPCR); Shri Rajendra Bharud, District Collector of Nandurbar; and Shri Sanjay S Gaikwad, Addl. District Magistrate,

Dhule. The Bench/ Camp at Nandurbar received an inadequate and restricted response from the participating District administration of Dhule and 189 Non Governmental Organisations (NGO) involved from both the districts across the various sectors of health, education, juvenile justice, child labour etc. despite prevailing child- centric issues in all the core indicators of development as stated by NITI AAYOG.

Name of the	Education	Juvenile	Child	POCSO	Child	Child	Total
District		Justice	Health		Labour	Psychology	
Nandurbar	28	24	11	1	11	6	81
Dhule		17			1		18
Total						99	

DISCLAIMER: The data presented above is the initial data as per the day of the Camp/ Bench.

#### Juvenile Justice

The bench/Camp received 41 complaints on the day of the sittings of the bench/Camp. The complaints are further divided into various section:

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL COMPLAINTS
1	Cases related to child sponsorship	1
2 Child injured due to electricity poll		1
3	Infrastructural deficit and irregularities in CCIs	8
4	Child Marriage	1
5	Staff related issues of Child Welfare officers/ DCPU and other department etc.	30
	Total	41

#### Highlights of the Complaints

• Suo-Moto cognizance was taken of 4 CCIs of taloda Tehsil in Nandurbar district. Based on the visit dated 25/07/2019, the 4 CCIs shared the same compound and were situated in close proximity. One of the rooms in Kankeshwar Balaksharam Pachas CCI was used as storage for onions and there were no children residing in the home. Across the 4 CCIs, there was an evident lack of amenities, availability of toilets in the premises among other grave infrastructural deficits and severe violations under the purview of JJ ACT 2015.

- Based on the visit to in C. R children home dated 25/07/2019, suo- moto cognizance was taken based on
  the irregularities observed despite the sitting of JJB and CWC in the same premises, there were no
  beds/ cots available for children, lack of staff including superitendant, no maintenance of registers, diet
  chart etc among other deficits.
- As per the discussion with DCPU, suo moto cognizance was taken for filling up the post of counselors in 8 out of 9 CCIs in Nandurbar District.
- Complaint was taken up pertaining to extending sponsorship to two children abandoned by father but sustained by their mother who barely had any means/daily wages and belonged to below poverty line.
- Cases were also received against the current prevalence of child begging across Nandurbar district.

  Strigent action in this regard was taken to curb the current practice.

## POCSO (LAWS RELATED TO CHILDREN)

The bench/Camp received 1 complaints on the day of the sittings of the bench/Camp.

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL COMPLAINTS
1 Harassment faced by young girls by a group of boys		1
	outside a school in Nandurbar	

#### Child Labour

The bench/Camp received 12 complaints on the day of the sittings of the bench/Camp. The complaints are further divided into various section:

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL COMPLAINTS
1	Prevalence of Child Labour in Nandurbar district	6
2	Rescue of child labour from bar	1
3	Insufficiencies in labour department, Nandurbar – lack of staff, office space, additional charge on labour officer of 4 districts	4
4 Lack of grant released to labour department since 2014		1
	12	

### **Highlights of Complaints**

- Suo-motu cognizance was taken of a 17 year-old child found working in a bar at hotel Navjivan in Mangal Bazaar, Nandurbar.
- Various complaints were present by the Department of Labour Officials. Govt. Labour officer put forth
  6 complaints pertaining to additional charge of 5 districts on Govt Labour officer, insufficient staff, lack
  of grant since 2014, lack of separate office space for labour department and lack of UDISE number
  given to children education department despite multiple demands.

#### CHILD PSYCHOLOGY

The bench/ camp received 6 complaints on the day of the sitting of the bench/camp. The complaints were pertaining to:

- Prevalence of substance abuse in Nandurbar district;
- Establishment of a de-addiction rehabilitation centre and mental hostpital in district against the absence of such facility in the entire district and;
- Ensuring accessibility of psychological assessment and outreach of speech therapy etc. to a diagnosed with mental retardation;
- Ensuring the outreach of training of counselors in DCPU/ CCi staff on basic counseling skills and rehabilitation techniques.

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL COMPLAINTS
1	Psychological assessment and access of mental	1
	care facilities: occipital therapy, speech therapy	
	etc for a mentally retarded child	
2	Establishment of mental health hospital in	1
	Nandurbar district	
3	Establishment of drug de-addiction and	2
	rehabilitation centre in Nandurbar district	
4	Restricting the supply of tobacco and allied	1
	substance at shops in Nandurbar	
5	Training of counselors in CCIs / DCPU/ CDPO	1
	staff in basic counseling skills	
	Total	6

## CHILD HEALTH

The Commission received 11 complaints on the day of the sitting of the bench/ Camp. The complaints were pertaining to the broad areas of:-

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL COMPLAINTS		
1	Infrastructural deficits in Anganwadi centres	4		
2	Cases related to construction of Anganwadi centre	lated to construction of Anganwadi 2		
3	Sanitation and hygiene issues in residential locality affecting child health	1		
4	Sickle cell amnesia camps for children in talode block, Nandurbar	1		
5	Cases related to eye injury and issuing of disability certificate accordingly	1		
6	Filling up of vacancies in ICDS functionary and primary health centres	2		
Total		11		

## **EDUCATION**

The Commission received 28 complaints on the day of the sitting of the bench/ Camp. The complaints were pertaining to the broad areas of:-

SECTION	NATURE OF COMPLAINTS	TOTAL
		COMPLAINTS
1	Corporal Punishment	1
2	Infrastructural decifits in Zila Parishad schools- lack of safe drinking water, toilets, leakage in roofs, lack of furniture etc.	5
3	School Safety	1
4	Availabilty of good roads and transportation facility in schools for children	1

5	Lack of special school for blind children	1
6	Non- compliance of NCERT books in private schools	1
7	Leaving certificate not issued by school authorities	3
8	Scholarship/ Sponsorship of education	2
9	Vacant post of staff in education department, Nandurbar and staff released issues	2
10	Non- navailability of library	1
11	Lack of enrolment in school due to economical reasons	1
12	Inappropriate uniform in primary schools lack of school shoes/ children barefoot in school	1
13	Provision of facility for inclusion of children attending school with sickle cell disease	1
14	Workshops for children doing substance abuse in school and other deviant behavioral activities	3
15	Inappropriate method method of teaching by teacher in ZP school	1
16	Infrastructural deficits in government residential hostel for girls- drink water facility etc.	1
17	Allocation of UDISE number by education dept.	2

#### I. COMPLAINT ANALYSIS ACCORDING TO NITI AAYOG INDICATORS

The National bench/camp of NCPCR is being conducted in those districts which are declared 'aspirational' by NITI Aayog. The NITI Aayog analysed these districts based on 49 indicators segregated in five sectors-Health, Education, Agriculture & Water resources, Financial Inclusion and Basic Infrastructure. Since NCPCR has a mandate to take complaints in the matters related to child rights violations. Therefore, the Commission has placed its focus on two key sectors- Education & Health & Nutrition focusing on the facilities provided to children. Then again while examining the complaints that Commission received while conducting the bench/camp in aspirational district, not all complaints could be analysed based on the indicators laid down by the NITI Aayog.

Education sector is analysed based on major indicators laid down by Niti Aayog.

S.NO	SECTOR	NITI AAYOG INDICATORS	COMPLAINTS RECEIVED BASED ON THE INDICATORS	DISTRICT
1	EDUCATION	Percentage of schools with drinking water	4	Nandurbar
2		Toilet access:  percentage schools  with functional girls'	5	Nandurbar
		toilets		Dhule (for all ZP schools)

S.NO	SECTOR	NITI AAYOG INDICATORS	COMPLAINTS RECEIVED BASED ON THE INDICATORS	DISTRICT
1		Percentage of Primary	1	Nandurbar
		Health Centres		
		compliant to Indian		
	I I E A I MI I	Public Health Standards		
2	HEALTH	Proportion of		
		Anganwadis with own	1	Dhule
		buildings		
3		Percentage of severe	2	Nandurbar
		Acute Malnourishment		
		(SAM) in children		
		under 6 years to total		
		in children under 6		
		years		
4		Percentage of	2	Nandurbar
		Moderate Acute		
		Malnourishment (SAM)		
		in children under 6		
		years to total in		
		children under 6 years		

### **CONCLUSION**

National Commission for Protection of Child Rights registered 99 complaints on the day of the bench/camp. 76 complaints were resolved and submitted to the respective departments to take action on the issues related to child rights violation on the day of the bench/camp under stipulated time period. The Bench/ Camp received the representation of the cases related to child rights violation under the broad areas of child health, education prohibition of child labour and juvenile justice. The Commission received extensive support from the district administration, Nandurbar. However, despite publicity through mass media, the responses from the general public in reporting grievances directly to the bench were limited and inadequate. Nevertheless, significant directions were passed issued in monitoring and implementation of various child rights related laws and policies.

## ANNEXURE

S.No.	Name of NGO	Contact details
1	S.B.M.SNGO	9657825963
		mirabhosale@gmail.com
2	Childline Dhule	9158039043
		<u>childlinedhule@gmail.com</u>
3	Arud foundation	9822953790
		arud.org@gmail.com
4.	Yahamogi Adiwasi Sanstha	9421199281
		vitthal.kadam75@gmail.com
6	Childline Nandurban	8275590487
		childline1098@gmail.com
7	Rukhambai balikosh	9764169250
		ruralfoundation@yahoo.in
8	Education Primary & Secondary	8806768391
		mvkadameo@gmail.com
9	Shabari Bahuud deshiye	9423288658
		vasaveramesh17@gmail.com
10	Piramal Foundation	985004008
		kishor.gharat@piramalfoundation.org
11	Yuvaranj Fondation	8308490100
		7887584100
		jitulule@gmail.com
12	Indira Mahila Seva Society	9923467521
		msksnandurbal@gmail.com
13	Multipurpose Foundation	9011032465
		patilpravin829@gmail.com